**Reviewer's report**

**Title:** The impact of pretransplant 25-hydroxy vitamin D deficiency on subsequent graft function: An observational study

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 1 December 2011

**Reviewer:** Didier Ducloux

**Reviewer's report:**

Kim et al reported a study on the impact of pretransplant 25-OH D3 deficiency on subsequent graft function. Briefly, they included 131 patients who underwent kidney transplantation. They measured 25-OH D3 before transplant and defined 25-OH deficiency as a concentration < 10ng/ml. They found that 25-OH D3 deficiency was associated with female gender, low serum albumin level, and peritoneal dialysis. 25-OH D3 level was the only parameter associated with eGFR during the 36-month follow-up period.

I have major concern with this study.
Even when the question is of interest, this study suffers from too many biases.
The number of patients included in the study is too low to reasonably answer this question.
A number of confounding factors (donor age, cold ischemia, PRA, …) are lacking. As a consequence, it is very difficult to interpret the association between 25-OH D3 level and graft function.
The results suggest that 25-OH D3 level is more important for graft function than acute rejection. I do not think that it is realistic.