Reviewer's report

Title: Safety and hemostatic efficacy of fibrin pad in partial nephrectomy: Results of an open label Phase I and a randomized, standard-of-care-controlled Phase I/II study

Version: 3 Date: 27 July 2012

Reviewer: Brian R Lane

Reviewer's report:

The authors should be commended on publishing the results of these early clinical trials, demonstrating the limits of a new hemostatic agent during partial nephrectomy. To improve the quality and understandability of the manuscript, however, they should indicate what techniques were used as SOC during the phase II trial. It is not entirely clear whether both arms had arterial clamping prior to tumor excision in this trial, and whether suture ligature was used for TBS in either arm. It is clear from their discussion that these techniques are necessary, but the wording in the methods and results could help here.

In addition, this article seems more suited to BMC Urology than BMC Nephrology. Why has it not been submitted/published there?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'