Reviewer’s report

Title: Bone marrow-derived cells can acquire renal stem cells properties and ameliorate ischemia-reperfusion induced acute renal injury

Version: 3 Date: 19 April 2012

Reviewer: Benedetta Bussolati

Reviewer’s report:

As I explained in the previous revision, the central point of this manuscript is the demonstration that BM-derived cells migrate and integrate into the tubular structures after I/R injury. The authors
1. did not follow my suggestion to confirm this point with another technique.
2. identified GFP+ cells as such. No indication of anti-GFP Abs used is provided. The use of GFP Abs, possibly detected by immunohistochemistry and not by immunofluorescence, is generally suggested.
3. The authors claim to lack autofluorescence in the kidney after I/R injury. The detection of autofluorescence in the kidney is a very common problem. Did the authors perform any technique to prevent this problem?

As in the literature GFP detection is known to present several limitations (see for instance Swenson ES, et al. Limitations of green fluorescent protein as a cell lineage marker. Stem Cells. 2007) I think that the authors did not prove the point of BM cell integration into the kidney.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interest