Reviewer’s report

Title: Survival in dialysis patients is not different between patients with diabetes as primary renal disease and patients with diabetes as a co-morbid condition.

Version: 1 Date: 5 October 2011

Reviewer: Chiu-ching Huang

Reviewer’s report:

Reviewer’s report

- Major Compulsory Revisions
This multicenter prospective cohort study (NECOSAD) gives interesting information of Dutch patients, comparing survivals of those with diabetes as primary renal disease or diabetes as a co-morbid condition. The most important message is patients with either diabetes as primary renal disease or diabetes as a co-morbid condition have increased mortality risks when compared to non-diabetic patients. Contrary to the general belief that patients with diabetes as primary renal disease may have inferior survivals than those with diabetes as a co-morbid condition due to more severe end-organ damage in the former group.
The manuscript is well written with clarity. The limitation of the study is well described in discussion.
Unfortunately, there is confusion about the tables. The content of Table 2 and Table 3 (page 8) did not match the description in the text. Moreover, Table 4 (page 9) which was mentioned in the text was not found in Table section (page 17-18). There appears one table is missing. The authors must revise their tables.
The other concern I have about this study is number of patients with diabetes as primary renal disease (N=281) and diabetes as co-morbid condition (N=107) were relatively small.

- Minor Essential Revisions
1. Page 16, Table 1. I suggest you to add p values, denoting the significance of differences of variables between these three groups.
2. Page 8: Please describe how many patients switched modality between HD and PD.
3. Page 9, line 15-17: You mentioned further adjustment for risk factors and co-morbidities did not materially influence the study results in HD and PD patients. I urge you to report the numbers of hazard ratio and 95% CI of this model in the text.
4. Page 9, line 6-10 and Page 11, line 13-15: You mentioned” Mortality risk in PD patients for diabetes as primary renal disease was increased compared to patients without diabetes, whereas this was not the case in PD patients with diabetes as co-morbid condition.” This insignificance may also be possible due
to relative small number of PD patients with diabetes as co-morbid condition. This possibility needs to be mentioned in the section of Discussion.

5. Number of patients with diabetes as primary renal disease (N=281) and diabetes as co-morbid condition (N=107) were relatively small in this study. Please clarify how many patients in each group received either PD or HD? I also suggest you to show number of patients left in each follow up year of each three groups in Fig A and Fig B.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.