Reviewer’s report

Title: Dismal long term outcome of patients undergoing interventional lung assist membrane ventilator treatment and concomitant need for extended dialysis

Version: 1 Date: 20 January 2011

Reviewer: raymond vanholder

Reviewer’s report:

This is an interesting paper.
In general, I have not too many major remarks:
- The fact that outcome is worse in a given acutely ill patient population if AKI necessitating RRT develops is of course not exceptional and has been depicted in many populations. Perhaps the authors should point this out in their discussion.
- I am a bit surprised that only one index of severity of disease is mentioned (SOFA) and e.g. not APACHE II or III.
- The worse outcome in patients on ED and iLA is probably related to their worse general condition. Also this should be mentioned.
- Why is the Horowitz index not mentioned in table 1?
- The wording is sometimes awkward. Revision by a genuine English speaker might be useful:
  o Background, line 4: “among other organs” does not fit with what follows where not organs but effects are discussed.
  o Line 6: “Also patients with non-severe pneumonia” – is there no “in” missing?
  o Line 14: “the 28 day survival of these patients” – do you mean patients with ARDS or patients with ARDS on lung assist? Please specify.
  o Etc, etc

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests