Reviewer's report

Title: TITLE: Risk factors for acute kidney injury following orthotopic liver transplantation: the impact of changes in renal function while patients await transplantation

Version: 3 Date: 4 October 2010

Reviewer: Giorgina Barbara Piccoli

Reviewer's report:

Overall the Authors did a good effort in answering to the questions risen by the referee.
Even if the following points may however reflect my opinions instead of those of the previous reviewer, coming from a different background, there are still, in my opinion, three points to be better clarified.

Point 1)a:
a comment on why crucial data (urine output) were not gathered should be of help in understanding the quality of the data collection. (for example, The data are gathered 20 yrs ago, when the attention to urine output was less systematic).

Point 1b.
The sentence: analysis of peri-OLT kidney biopsies should probably be further explained, as this is probably not a general practice.

Question: how was BMI calculated?
While no formula is devoid of biases and errors and none is validated in ascitic patients, the bias in calculating BMI on the actual body weight should be commented upon.

Personal comment.
The paper is based upon an old database, which probably do not reflect, as pointed out by the referees, the present situations of OLT patients. While I agree with the Authors that there may be a lot to learn from older studies, it is not clear to me, even in the revised version of the paper, why we may still have a specific interest at looking to these data. Is the paper in a way a “model” for understanding the present behaviour of OLT patients and of patients with other forms of AKI. While the answer is presumably Yes, I think that this point should be extensively discussed, from the introduction to the conclusions, to ensure the reader that a lesson for the present may still be found in an old database.
In this regard, I wonder, as the authors commented on the differences between older and present OLT procedures, why not comparing the older data with newer ones?