Reviewer's report

Title: Low documentation of chronic kidney disease among high-risk patients in a managed care population: a retrospective cohort study

Version: 1 Date: 3 August 2009

Reviewer: Donal O'Donoghue

Reviewer's report:

Review of BMC Nephrology manuscript: ‘Low documentation of chronic kidney disease among high-risk patients in a managed care population: a retrospective cohort study’

Thank you for asking me to review this study. The paper examines the documentation of CKD in a Kaiser Permanente CKD population from Georgia. The questions posed and methods used are appropriate and adequately described.

Overall the paper is well written and limitations are clearly stated.

Minor essential revisions:

I think it would be helpful to record the timeframe that the study was undertaken in as awareness of CKD is changing rapidly.

I think it would be helpful for the authors to avoid classifying people between the eGFR of 60 and 90 mls / min as having CKD. Without other markers of kidney disease it is not possible to use the GFR to identify CKD at this level and the estimation formula are least good with well preserved kidney function.

The authors suggest that early identification delays progression to reverse RD and decreases mortality. Given the fact there have not been randomised controlled trials I think it would be appropriate to say that early identification MAY delay progression and decrease mortality.

Reference 12 is not cited.

Discretionary revisions:

The authors may want to discuss the fact that the MDRD formula used is the 186 formula rather than the IDMS formula. It is not clear if the assay has been calibrated against the Cleveland clinic original MDRD assay and if not there maybe significant differences.

What next:

I would recommend acceptance with the minor essential revisions.

I declare that I have no competing interests.
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.