Reviewer’s report

Title: Accuracy and limitations of equations for predicting of the glomerular filtration rate during follow-up of patients with non-diabetic nephropathies

Version: 1 Date: 28 March 2009

Reviewer: Peter Rossing

Reviewer’s report:

This is an interesting study where the association between inulin clearance, CG CGbsa, and MDRD(4 var) are compared in 260 pts and in 126 pts follow up is made median 42 months.

Comments

2 measurements of GFR or 6 months of follow up is a very short time to determine decline in GFR. What happens if you limit the observations to patients with at least 3 measurements and at least 18-24 months of FU?

As mentioned and discussed the major limitation is the lack of standardised creatinine measurements (at least for the evaluation of MDRD) but this is thoroughly discussed by the authors at present.

Was the inaccuracy of the formulae related to clinical features of the patients (obesity, diagnosis of renal disease, age, sex?)

You should refer to the large study by I Stevens regarding cystatin C combined with creatinine.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

No competing interests