Reviewer’s report

Title: TCF7L2 Gene Polymorphisms do not Predict Susceptibility to Diabetes in Tropical Calcific Pancreatitis

Version: 1 Date: 21 March 2008

Reviewer: Atsushi Masamune

Reviewer’s report:

In this study, Mahurkar et al. examined the association of the TCF7L2 polymorphisms, the major susceptibility gene for type 2 diabetes, with the tropical calcific pancreatitis (TCP) and fibro-calculus pancreatic diabetes (FCPD). Based on the absence of statistically significant association of the TCF7L2 polymorphisms, the authors concluded that the diabetes in these pancreatic disorders might not be similar to common type 2 diabetes. Genetic background of TCP and FCPD is still unclear except for the prominent role of the N34S mutation in the SPINK1 gene. This is the first report showing the lack of association of the TCF7L2 gene in these unique entities of chronic pancreatitis. Overall, this is a well-designed and well-performed study. However, TCP and FCPD are very unique clinical entities only in the tropical region. Most of the medical doctors except for those working in the tropical region do not have an access to patients with TCP or FCPD.

Major

1. The conclusion that diabetes in these pancreatic disorders is not similar to type 2 diabetes appears to be overstated. If the TCF7L2 is a specific SNP for type 2 diabetes, this is OK. However, as the authors are aware, some studies have suggested an association between the TCF7L2 gene and type 1 diabetes. Therefore, the reviewer suggests that the conclusion should be merely the lack of association of TCF7L2 polymorphisms in TCP and FCPD.

Minor

1. Type 2 diabetes, tropical calcific pancreatitis, and fibro-calculus pancreatic diabetes are not abbreviated throughout the text.
2. References list does not follow the style of the journal.

Atsushi Masamune, M.D., Ph.D.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.