Reviewer's report

Title: Insulin gene polymorphisms in type 1 diabetes, Addison's disease and the polyglandular autoimmune syndrome type II

Version: 1 Date: 9 May 2008

Reviewer: Behrooz Z. Alizadeh

Reviewer's report:

1. The question posed by authors is not well defined:
The provided information in the introduction does not sufficiently support the hypotheses presented on page 3, lines 25 to 26, "therefore ....... targets", or the research question, presented on page 3, line 26 to page 4, line 2 "It is therefore ... to other autoimmune diseases .... on the T cell thymic receptors." Simply, on the basis of provided information, results and references, I do not see how I can line up the following claim of the authors [ SNP > differential thymus expression > tolerance > expression in target cells > diseases; compared to that of controls]

2. The methods are not sufficiently well described. Two major points: a. Given the observed sub-structural population among Germans, are controls matched to the patients, and if not how then it can affect the results. b. The study power is low, and how it can deteriorate the true association, if they exist.

4. The manuscript is now better adhering to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition.

5. The discussion and conclusions adequately supported by the data. But the references and the data published by others have not been discussed clearly. It must be clear what reference contribute how to the study hypothesis or the discussion.

9. Writing still need to be improved for obvious errors: wither use T1D or type 1 diabetes, but not both through out the manuscript.

Since the study size was limited and thus the results remains inconclusive, I strongly recommend doing a Meta-analysis of all the published data on a relation between the snps and the outcomes studied in this manuscript.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.