Reviewer's report

Title: Association between LRP5 polymorphism and bone mineral density: a Bayesian meta-analysis

Version: 1 Date: 5 April 2008

Reviewer: Yu-ming M Chen

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

General comments:
The authors examined the association between LRP5 polymorphism and bone mineral density using meta-analysis. The paper addresses an interesting topic. Generally, this article is a well-designed and written paper. The results should be reasonable. I can hardly find a major limitation in this article. However, a large-scale multicenter collaborative study (GENOMOS Study) has been recently published (JAMA. 2008 Mar 19;299(11):1277-90). This study has already pooled the association between LRP5 polymorphism (including A1330V) and bone mineral density and fracture in both men and women based on individual level data on 37534 individuals. It seemed that there was no necessary to conduct another meta-analysis, because this issue was extensively addressed by the GENOMOS Study.

Minor Essential Revisions

Specific comments
Title: It would be better to omit the word of “Bayesian” because the main results were generated from usual meta-analysis rather than Bayesian meta-analysis.

They might miss a few important studies (e.g., E. Grundberg et al. Osteoporos Int. 2007 Nov 17 [Epub ahead of print] ).

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests' below