Reviewer's report

Title: Folliculin mutations are not associated with severe COPD

Version: 2 Date: 1 November 2008

Reviewer: Laura Schmidt

Reviewer's report:

The authors have adequately addressed the suggested revisions of this reviewer and the comments of the other two reviewers. The study was well designed to investigate a potential role for folliculin mutations in COPD. The data support no association between mutations in this novel tumor suppressor gene and COPD which is important information for those who manage and treat BHD and COPD patients.

Although reviewer #3 has raised concerns about the biological and scientific significance of analyzing BHD mutations in COPD, the authors have adequately justified their study and responded completely point by point to the concerns raised by that reviewer in their rebuttal letter. This study was scientifically important and will contribute to our increasing understanding of the role of folliculin mutations in the pathogenesis of cystic lung disease and associated emphysema-like changes in the lung.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare I have no competing interests.