Reviewer's report

Title: No germ line mutations in supposed tumor suppressor genes SAFB1 and SAFB2 in familial breast cancer with linkage to 19p.

Version: 1 Date: 31 July 2008

Reviewer: ARUNA S. JAISWAL

Reviewer's report:

The research paper entitled “No germ line mutations in supposed tumor suppressor genes SAFB1 and SAFB2 in familial breast cancer with linkage to 19p ” by Annika Bergman et al., for publication in BMC Central, Medical genetics has been reviewed. Following are comments of the manuscript.

The observation noted by the authors is certainly noteworthy but still difficult to predict the outcome based upon data set. This needs to be investigated for the broader group of samples along with at least some functional aspect. The present study is limited in its scope and lack sufficient data which could potentially support the hypothesis proposed by the authors. Authors should use alternative strategy to rule out any technical issues. They have put forth there efforts in assembling this manuscript based on the limited data to support their observation. The present form of manuscript needs revision.

1. There is no mention of breast cancer incidence and mortality rate in the introduction section which leaves the reader to underestimate the severity of the problem being addressed.

2. Last four lines of introduction overstates about the proposed study where findings are just limited in identifying the mutational status of SAFB1 & SAFB2 genes without any mention of their functional aspect of these gene products.

3. Did the author take the identical number of individually matched controls.

4. Authors have reported that there is linkage to chromosome 19p where SAFB1 and SAFB2 are located and while consequence and significance of mutation on the functional aspect needs to be discussed.

5. What is clinical pathobiological difference in patients 1 vs others?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
No to all.
I declare that I have no competing interests.