Reviewer’s report

Title: Susceptibility to Type 1 Diabetes conferred by the PTPN22 C1857T Polymorphism in the Spanish population

Version: 4 Date: 9 July 2007

Reviewer: Klaus Badenhoop

Reviewer’s report:

Although the authors have improved their manuscript, there is still an unclear presentation of the finding in prepubertal girls with T1D and a misleading presentation of the gender analysis.

Therefore the abstract should state:

in Results.... "Furthermore this allele showed a significant association in female patients with diabetes onset before age 16 years (OR2.95 (CI 1.59-5.33), female patients vs female controls p=0.0009)*. No other associations in specific subgroups stratified for gender, HLA susceptibility or age at onset were observed."

*The authors need to check this p-value since in table 2 they give a p-value of p=0.0001 and an OR of 2.92

There is no point in comparing female vs male patients! The comparison has to be made between patients and controls. Therefore the non-significant p-values of these comparisons have to be removed.

The point in stressing the significance in prepubertal girls could mean that there is an interacting factor with PTPN22 yet to be identified.