Reviewer’s report

Title: The effect of ABCA1 gene polymorphisms on lipid profile and ischaemic stroke risk

Version: 1 Date: 30 October 2006

Reviewer: david evans

Reviewer’s report:

General
This paper investigates the association between haplotypes in the ABCA1 gene and with stroke. The study is well designed and carried out and is worthy of publication.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
1. Background. Tangier disease is controversially associated with atherosclerosis rather than a high risk as stated in line 12. e.g Assmann et al in Metabolic and Molecular Basis of Inherited Disease favour a moderately increased risk of cardiovascular disease.
2. Given the essentially negative nature of the findings the authors should consider providing a formal power calculation.
3. In the literature the affect of variation in ABCA1 on plasma lipids is not consistent. It would be helpful if the authors were to provide their original data and not just a summary.
4. In their review (ATVB 23:1322), Singaraja et al suggest that as the atheroprotective effect of the K219 allele is observed only in certain circumstances the functional effect may be significant in certain genetic and environmental backgrounds. The authors may like to consider this point. Perhaps in sub-groups of their probands a protective effect is apparent.
5. Type in Ref 29 should conform to the remaining refs.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare I have no competing interests.