Reviewer's report

Title: The effect of ABCA1 gene polymorphisms on lipid profile and ischaemic stroke risk

Version: 1 Date: 23 October 2006

Reviewer: Marta Tomas

Reviewer's report:

General
The paper by Pasdar et al. analyses the association among ABCA1 haplotypes and stroke risk or lipid profile. The authors found significant associations between two haplotypes and stroke risk, and also between one polymorphism and LDL-cholesterol in determined groups.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
The present assessed topic is an interesting question. However, the methodology to answer to it is quite weak. The major part of results is based on lipid data which is not reliable. Lipids from cases were determined in the acute phase of stroke, which are not representative of their normal status. For controls, lipid data is available only in less than 50% of the sample. Moreover, analysis regarding the stroke risk has not been adjusted for any variable that appeared significantly different among cases and controls in the bivariate analysis (age, hypertension).

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound
Level of interest: An article of limited interest
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: No
Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests