Reviewer's report

Title: A novel mutation in the SH3BP2 gene causes cherubism

Version: 2 Date: 11 October 2006

Reviewer: Jan de Lange

Reviewer's report:

General
The authors did address to the main critique on the manuscript. This improved the content of the manuscript and made it more readable. Moreover, valuable information on the affected family members has been added.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

In spite of the addition of the perivascular cuffing, the passage on the histological features is confusing and it is not clear which features can or cannot be distinguished from other giant cell lesions.

It is still a case report and should be re-styled accordingly. Especially the method section is wrongly used to present the cases. It is mandatory to correct this.

The first report on the 100% penetrance of cherubism in males and 50-70% in females is not from Quan but from Anderson and McClendon:
This should be corrected.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.