Reviewer’s report

Title: Meta-analysis on the effect of the N363S polymorphism of the glucocorticoid receptor gene (GRL) on human obesity

Version: 1 Date: 23 January 2006

Reviewer: Anthony Comuzzie

Reviewer’s report:

General
In general this is a well written article; unfortunately the results presented are of relatively limited interest since they only rule out an effect of one particular variant and not the gene. This observation would be of much greater interest if there were strong prior support for this variant being functional with regards to obesity. Given what we now know regarding the often chaotic pattern of linkage disequilibrium (even within genes), not having full information regarding the genetic variation within a gene makes interpreting such studies in a meaningful biological manner basically impossible.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

At minimum the authors should consider typing all known variants in this gene, or even better to re-sequence a sufficient number of individuals to determine this for themselves. Including such information into an analysis as presented here would then allow the authors to either detect an effect of this gene or to state with greater confidence that this gene does not affect variation in obesity related traits in the populations examined.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject because too small an advance to publish

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests