Reviewer's report

Title: Eight previously unidentified mutations found in the OA1 ocular albinism gene

Version: 4 Date: 19 April 2006

Reviewer: Maria Vittoria M Schiaffino

Reviewer's report:

General
Since the previous version, the revised manuscript by Mayeur et al. has somehow been improved with respect to my second point, regarding the low rate of mutation identification, since some patients have been found to carry intragenic deletions and the interpretation of the results is now more consistent with the current literature. Nevertheless, my first point remains unmodified. Unfortunately, the work lacks significant novelty, given that over 40 mutations have already been identified in the OA1 gene by a number of groups, including the authors, and the mutations identified herein are not particularly remarkable with respect to those already described. Overall, my view is that this manuscript displays the features of a mutation report on an already well characterized gene, thus being of interest for a quite specialized audience. Having said this, I think the decision about publication should now be taken at an editorial level.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)