Reviewer's report

Title: Deletions in the Y-derived amelogenin gene fragment in the Indian population

Version: 2 Date: 25 March 2006

Reviewer: Yuet Meng Chang

Reviewer's report:

General

The revised manuscript entitled "Deletions in the Y-derived amelogenin gene fragment in the Indian population" contains changes to address the major compulsory revision points. Changes have been duly made to include the Y-STR haplotype and haplogroup data for the ten null samples in Table 1, and the haplogroup results for the reference Indian population are now reported. Overall the revised manuscript has been revised appropriately and it is my opinion that the present work is now suitable for publication in the BMC Medical Genetics, after the following minor changes are made.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

- 

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. Table 1: A small footnote to explain that the integers in bold represent the shared haplotype between Agharia and Kallar, whilst the integers in italics represent the shared haplotype between Khatri and Kuruva. The authors also need to explain what "–" means under the Y-SNP column, i.e. whether those samples have been analyzed?

2. Reference 16: There is a comma after Shen P.

3. Consistency of the word “amelogenin” or “Amelogenin” in the text, for example in the last paragraph of “Background”.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

- 

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.