Reviewer's report

Title: Age at onset of Huntington disease is not modulated by the R72P variation in TP53 and the R196K variation in the gene coding for the human caspase activated DNase (hCAD)

Version: 3 Date: 19 September 2005

Reviewer: Samir K Brahmachari

Reviewer's report:

General
The authors have modified the title of the paper which now reflects the study represented in the paper. However, authors have not addressed the questions raised earlier, i.e., there may be different sets of polymorphisms in the same genes in the studied cohort which could still show modifier effect. Authors have not attempted to look at those polymorphisms. The study, therefore, is restrictive and shows that in a well characterized Caucasian cohort of HD patient, Genotypes of these two polymorphisms (R72P in TP53 and R196K in hCAD) are not associated with the age of onset.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests