Reviewer's report

Title: Age at onset of Huntington disease is not modulated by the R72P variation in TP53 and the R196K variation in the gene coding for the human caspase activated DNase (hCAD)

Version: 3 Date: 31 August 2005

Reviewer: Toshiharu Nagatsu

Reviewer's report:

General
1) The new title is better.
2) This is a replication study. Furthermore, the results are negative concluding that age at onset of Huntington's disease is not modulated by variations in these genes. The problem is that the reason for controversy from the recently published positive results by Chattopadhyay B et al (Reference 8) is not clear. The methods are not new. However, the present reviewer feels that although the results are not so impressive and negative data such study would be important for further study on this controversial issue.
I would suggest that this paper could be acceptable for publication.