Reviewer's report

Title: Age at onset of Huntington disease is not modulated by variations in the genes coding for TP53 and human caspase activated DNase (hCAD)

Version: 1 Date: 5 March 2005

Reviewer: Toshiharu Nagatsu

Reviewer's report:

General
The authors report that age at onset of Huntington disease (HD) is not modulated by variations in the genes coding for TP53 and human caspase activated DNase (hCAD). This is in contrast to the recently published positive results by Chattopadhyay B et al (Reference 8). The reason for controversy is not clear. As the present authors stated, they employed a larger cohort of exceptionally well-characterized HD patients, and the initial association reported by Chattopadhyay B et al may have been due to chance or to bias as introduced by population stratification. Although a true association might exist in Indians, this confirmation requires an larger sample size. The present paper is significant, although it reports negative results. Defining independent age-of-onset (AO) modifying factors is of great importance.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.