Reviewer's report

Title: Haploinsufficiency for BRCA1 is associated with normal levels of DNA nucleotide excision repair in breast tissue and blood lymphocytes

Version: 4 Date: 26 May 2005

Reviewer: Alex sgambato

Reviewer's report:

General

In this manuscript the nucleotide excision repair (NER) activity is evaluated in normal blood cells and breast tissue from a breast cancer patient carrying a BRCA1 mutation. The results obtained demonstrate that BRCA1 haploinsufficiency does not affect NER activity in these tissues.

The technical aspects of the report are fine.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

No major revisions needed

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

No minor revisions needed

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

I still believe that the focus of the study is the relationship between BRCA1 and NER activity and that, from this point of view, it is not relevant the fact that the patient was identified by low power MRI. Most of the clinical data might also be irrelevant for this study and could be eliminated, as previously suggested.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests