Reviewer's report

Title: Haploinsufficiency for BRCA1 is associated with normal levels of DNA nucleotide excision repair in breast tissue and blood lymphocytes

Version: 2 Date: 14 February 2005

Reviewer: James E Cleaver

Reviewer's report:

General
This report describes breast tissues from one patient who is haploinsufficient for BRCA1 that have been analysed for their nucleotide excision repair capacity. The experiments are technically satisfactory, but the manuscript is over-long. The results show no deficiencies in repair, and the tissues are essentially the same as those from a normal individual in all aspects studied.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
There is some doubt in my mind that this negative finding warrants such a long manuscript with over 50 references. If the authors think the observation is scientifically significant, they should make a major revision to a short note.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing financial interests