Reviewer’s report

Title: Impact of HFE genetic testing on clinical presentation of hereditary hemochromatosis: new epidemiological data

Version: 2 Date: 4 April 2005

Reviewer: Diane C Tucker

Reviewer’s report:

General

This is an interesting report.

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

In my opinion, the discussion could be more directly focused on the data presented and its implications. The authors do not discuss the increased age at diagnosis in men after the introduction of the genetic test. This seems counterintuitive and could be commented upon in the discussion.

On page 11 there is a ... Is this an unfinished sentence?

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests