Reviewer's report

Title: Evaluation of Slc11a1 as an inflammatory bowel disease candidate gene

Version: Date: 11 November 2004

Reviewer: C Folwaczny

Reviewer's report:

In their study the authors describe a negative result of a genetic association study. The concisely written manuscript describes a valid experimental set-up and leaves little to deserve.

Major comments:

From the current version of the manuscript it does not become clear, why the authors were unable to sustain their previously reported association of Slc11a1 single nucleotide tandem repeats with Crohn’s disease herein. The potential reasons for the divergent results should be discussed more detailed.

Minor comments:

Page 1: The current pathophysiological concept about IBD is not compatible with a classical autoimmune disorder, but comprises a genetically mediated abrogation of the immunologic tolerance towards luminal (e. g. bacterial) antigens resulting in an excessive largely T-cell driven immunologic activity which leads to a chronic inflammatory process within the bowel wall.

Page 4: The numbers of Crohn’s disease patients which had been classified in the different subgroups according to the Vienna classification should be depicted.

Page 6: It is unclear why the authors believe that combining subgroups L2 and L3 does not impair the validity of the statistical analysis.

It should be stated whether Slc11a1 is situated in a previously described linkage region.