Reviewer's report

Title: Genetic study of common variants at the Apo E, Apo AI, Apo CIII, Apo B, LP(a), lipoprotein lipase (LPL) and hepatic lipase (LIPC) genes and coronary artery disease (CAD): variation in LIPC gene associates with clinical outcomes in patients with established CAD

Authors:

Dr Marco G Baroni (marco.baroni@uniroma1.it)
Andrea Barni (andrea.berni@uniroma1.it)
Stefano Romeo (maktub76@hotmail.com)
Marcello Arca (marcelloarca@libero.it)
Tullio Tesorio (tultes@libero.it)
Giovanni Sorropago (giosorr@infinito.it)
Umberto Di Mario (umberto.dimario@uniroma1.it)
David J Galton (D.J.GALTON@mds.qmw.ac.uk)

Version: 1 Date: 8 Aug 2003

Reviewer: Vadim A Stepanov

Level of interest: A paper whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Advice on publication: Accept after discretionary revisions

The paper contributes new and interesting data to the field of genetic predisposition to common cardiovascular disease. Most interesting aspect of this case-control study is prospective analysis and findings of association of LIPC gene variation with CAD clinical outcomes. Material of the study was collected according appropriate clinical criteria and was analyzed with adequate experimental techniques and statistical approaches. Discussion is correct and conclusions inferred from the analysis are well supported by the experimental data.

I have only minor technical comments to authors' text.
First, in the Methods section (page 4) stated that exclusion criteria for control group members include age below 45 years, but the mean age for control group indicated in Table 1 is 43.77.5 years, i.e., less than exclusion threshold. This discrepancy needs explanation.
Second, designations of P levels in table 2 do not correspond to table legend.
Third, statement "data not shown" regarding association of gene variants with CAD (page 7, line 5-6) is not necessary, because primary data, i.e. allele frequencies in patients and in controls are presented in table 2 and, in fact, only chi-square is not shown.

Competing interests:

None declared.