Reviewer's report

Title: Linkage Analysis of HLA and Candidate Genes for Celiac Disease in a North American Family-Based Study

Authors:
Susan L Neuhausen (susan@genepi.med.utah.edu)
Michael Feolo (feolo@ncbi.nlm.nih.gov)
James Farnham (jfarnham@genepi.med.utah.edu)
Linda Book (pclbook@ihc.com)
John J Zone (zone@ultraderm.med.utah.edu)

Version: 1 Date: 8 Oct 2001

Reviewer: Dr Luigi Greco

Level of interest: A paper whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Advice on publication: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until I see revised version

The paper is quite weak : only 65 families, parents apparently not available
They explore only a small set of markers
The conclusions are more a show of Type II error in the study design than of negative results

There are by now 5 genome screening studies on coeliac disease , so than any new paper should at least consider the power of these studies.

The paper may nevertheless, be reported as a short communication , since it deals with a population (USA) which has not been covered in previous studies.

1. Introduction : redundant on coeliac disease description , but no mention on previous studies relevant to the aims.
Methods : shoud be shortened by 2/3

2. The choice of IDDM markers is quite outdated, since in IDDM itself have not been replicated

3. The results do not support with sufficient power a completely negative statement

Competing interests:
None declared.