Reviewer’s report

Title: Analysis of the contribution of FTO, NPC1, ENPP1, NEGR1, GNPDA2 and MC4R genes to obesity in Mexican children: a case-control study

Version: 2 Date: 23 October 2012

Reviewer: Solena LE SCOUARNEC

Reviewer’s report:

In this well-written manuscript, the authors have studied six European obesity-associated SNPs, in a population of Mexican children (obese / nonobese). The results describe, except for one significant association (1.34x10^-3, just below the significance threshold), nominal associations with obesity and/or BMI. As stated by the authors in the discussion, statistical power is limited in this study, and additional studies on Mexican children would be needed to confirm these observations. The most interesting findings are the association of risk alleles with decreased fasting serum insulin levels and fasting plasma glucose levels in nonobese children. This study emphasizes that there are some discrepancies between populations and between age groups within a population, and that more studies are needed to better define the genetic risk of obesity in children.

---Minor Essential Revisions

In the results section, rs775456 should be replaced by the correct rs ID (rs7754561).

At the end of the discussion section, “It noteworthy” should be replaced by “It is noteworthy”

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.