Reviewer's report

Title: Analysis of the contribution of FTO, NPC1, ENPP1, NEGR1, GNPDA2 and MC4R genes to obesity in Mexican children: a case-control study

Version: 2 Date: 9 October 2012

Reviewer: Kikuko Hotta

Reviewer's report:

Analysis of genetic factors for the obesity in children is important, since the number of studies of obesity in children is much less compared with adults. However, there are some issues.

1. The classification of BMI by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention CDC 2000 is not familiar to the non-Mexican readers. Moreover, the criterion of obese children was not clear. How did the authors calculate the 95th percentile?

2. Why did the authors select children with BMI<85th, not with BMI <75th, percentile as control subjects? The 85th percentile seems to be higher.

3. In table 3, metabolic quantitative traits, except BMI, should be adjusted with BMI.

4. The authors performed case-control study and QTL analysis. Therefore, 'a case-control study' should be deleted from title.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.