Reviewer's report

Title: Reduced genetic influence on childhood obesity in small for gestational age children

Version: 2 Date: 7 August 2012

Reviewer: Matthew Sabin

Reviewer's report:

A nice paper to review. Well written, with clear messages. References appropriate. Tables and Figures OK.

The tables are listed slightly out of order – please check (e.g. Table 1 is first mentioned in the text as showing the list of genes/SNPs but, in fact, Table 1 is something else. MAJOR COMPULSORY CHANGE

Results – first section. BMI Z score differences do not need to be repeated here if the data are also contained in tabulated form. MINOR ESSENTIAL CHANGE

I am uncertain why the statistical approach was carried out in 4 ways – please could this be checked with the journal’s statistician. MAJOR POINT

The authors discuss and conclude that non-genetic or environmental factors are more important in influencing BMI in those born SGA. Why? What about other genetic factors, such as variability in Type 2 diabetes susceptibility genes which might go along with the foetal insulin hypothesis? MAJOR COMPULSORY POINT FOR CONSIDERATION

The last sentence of the discussion needs rewording. MINOR ESSENTIAL CHANGE

Table 1 needs to be relabelled as differences in birth weight and SGA. Also what are the units for birth weight? Grams? MINOR ESSENTIAL CHANGE

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.