Author's response to reviews

Title: Genetic polymorphisms located in genes related to immune and inflammatory processes are associated with end-stage renal disease: a preliminary study

Authors:

Maria A Jiménez-Sousa (majimenezsousa@yahoo.es)
Elisabeth López (elopez2006@med.uva.es)
Amanda Fernández-Rodríguez (amandafr@isciii.es)
Eduardo Tamayo (tamayo@med.uva.es)
Pablo Fernández-Navarro (pfernandezn@isciii.es)
Laura Segura-Roda (lauzero@fiv.upv.es)
María Heredia (maria_her_05@hotmail.com)
José I Gómez-Herreras (jgomez012001@yahoo.es)
Jesús Bustamante (bustamante@med.uva.es)
Juan M García-Gómez (juanmig@ibime.upv.es)
Jesús F Bermejo-Martín (jbermejo@saludcastillayleon.es)
Salvador Resino (sresino@isciii.es)

Version: 4 Date: 22 June 2012

Author's response to reviews: see over
Dear Sir/Madam,

Thank you very much for your e-mail of June 15, 2012. Please find enclosed a point-by-point response to the reviewers’ comments and the new revised version of our manuscript. We hope that the current revised version of our manuscript is acceptable for publication. Please feel free to contact us regarding any further questions about our work.

Thank you very much for your consideration. We look forward to hearing from you at your earliest convenience.

Yours sincerely,

Salvador Resino García, PhD
Referee 1

Reviewer: Tibor Fulop

Reviewer's report:
General: The manuscript in the current format generally reads well and the authors have revised the paper substantially from the initial version, acknowledging the limitations of the paper well. We appreciate the reviewer’s comments.

Minor point: Conclusion, 3rd line: “protection or development of ESRD. These results The genotypes predisposing to ESDR” contains a minor error.

We have corrected the minor error in the conclusion section.

From “In conclusion, our preliminary data suggest that four polymorphisms (rs1801275, rs301640, rs4586, rs7830) related to inflammatory and immunity processes showed an association with protection or development of ESRD. These results The genotypes predisposing to ESDR could help to predict the risk of developing the disease, and also to improve the understanding of the pathways involved in the disease pathogenesis.”

To “In conclusion, our preliminary data suggest that four polymorphisms (rs1801275, rs301640, rs4586, rs7830) related to inflammatory and immunity processes showed an association with protection or development of ESRD. These results could help to predict the risk of developing the disease, and also to improve the understanding of the pathways involved in the disease pathogenesis.”

Elective point: I noted that study enrolled patient who had renal transplants between Y 1995 – 2008, but they have been matched with controls at the time of sample collection. One wonders, how the results would have look like (or whether the initial statistical association would have been maintained), had the authors have matched study patients with controls matched for the chronologic age, when ESRD was declared in study subjects or statistically adjusted for).

Due to study design that was made to follow this cohort of patients with ESRD, the age of patients was collected in the date of renal transplantation. Subjects from the control group were individuals who had age distribution similar to the age collected for case-group (date of transplantation) at the time of sample collection. Furthermore, study patients were not matched with controls for chronological age at the time of sample collection but for the age when they received the renal transplantation.

We changed the paragraph in M&M

From “Subjects in the case-group were patients older than 18 with ESRD that received a cadaver renal graft between December 1995 and October 2008. A DNA sample was taken in order to obtain SNP data. Subjects from the control-group were patients that underwent to routine analysis at the hospital and had no evidence of renal pathology or other immune or inflammatory diseases. Individuals were selected to have age and gender distribution similar to the case-group patients. In order to ensure homogeneity, all patients were Caucasian.”

To “Subjects in the case-group were patients older than 18 with ESRD that received a cadaver renal graft between December 1995 and October 2008. Subjects from the control-group were patients
that underwent to routine analysis at the hospital and had no evidence of renal pathology or other immune or inflammatory diseases. Individuals were selected to have age and gender distribution similar to the case-group patients at the time of transplantation. In this retrospective study, the clinical data and DNA samples were collected in a transversal way for both the case-group and the control-group between June 2008 and December 2008. In order to ensure homogeneity, all patients were Caucasian."