Reviewer's report

Title: The MAP2K5-linked SNP rs2241423 is associated with BMI and obesity in two cohorts of Swedish and Greek children

Version: 3 Date: 2 April 2012

Reviewer: George Dedoussis

Reviewer's report:

In this manuscript the authors present data on the association of the rs2241423 variant of the MAP2K5 gene on the risk of obesity and obesity indices in two paediatric cohorts of different origin.

The effect of this variant on obesity was recently published as the authors points out in their introduction section, therefore the results of this study do not add significant value to the litterature given in addition their nominal significance in both cohorts.

There are many incoistencies across the study like the numbers of subjects genotyped differ in the different sections of the manuscript. In the Abstract the authors should give the results of the analysis. In the discussion section most of the text should be placed in the introduction as it is not related with the data of the study.

Overall I would reccomend to modify the article to a letter underlying the nominal significance of the results in children cohorts.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.