Reviewer's report

Title: Genetic variations in APPL2 are associated with overweight and obesity in a Chinese population with normal glucose tolerance

Version: 3 Date: 28 February 2012

Reviewer: Francis Vasseur

Reviewer's report:

The manuscript MS: 1814028202630951
"Genetic variations in APPL2 are associated with overweight and obesity in a Chinese population with normal glucose tolerance" by Shan Jiang, Qichen Fang, Weihui Yu, Rong Zhang, Cheng Hu, Kun Dong, Yuqian Bao, Chen Wang, Kunsan Xiang and Weiping Jia, has been greatly amended according to my comments and suggestions. However a single major point remain to be modified before publication.

Regarding my previous #f where I precised that with median values of WHR of 0.849 for TT and 0.849 for CT it is not acceptable to conclude to an additive model as this would imply a significant difference between 0.849 and 0.849, I see that this was not taken into account by the authors as they wrote on line 153 "... under an additive model...". Either the authors clearly demonstrate a significant difference between the WHR values of TT and TC genotypes and may thus argue for an additive model, or they conclude to a recessive model as is supported by their data and was requested in my previous report.

This notion of a recessive model rather than an additive one was already requested in the initial report and following the third version of the manuscript has not yet been taken into account.

Minor remark: although the research and publication of scientific articles in the field of genetics is an exciting job that may be addictive, at line 153 of the manuscript the authors should have used "additive" instead of "addictive". Although this notion of additive model should be deleted regarding to my previous remark the authors should take care that another "addictive" is not hidden in the manuscript.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests