Author's response to reviews

Title: Molecular and Neurological Characterizations of three Saudi Families with Lipoid Proteinosis

Authors:

Mustafa A. Salih (mustafasalih@ksu.edu.sa)
Khaled K. Abu-Amero (abuamero@gmail.com)
Saleh M. Alrasheed (salrasheed@yahoo.com)
Ibrahim A. Alorainy (ibrahimorainy@ksu.edu.sa)
Lu M. Liu (tmbosley@bosleynet.net)
John A. McGrath (Mcgrath@yahoo.com)
Lionel M. Van Maldergem (Madegraven@gmail.com)
Yasser H. Al-faky (Alfakyyasser@nesma.co.uk)
Adel M. Suhaibani (suhaibani@yahoo.com)
Darren T. Oystreck (Oystreck@gmail.com)
Thomas M. Bosley (tmbosley@bosleynet.net)

Version: 3 Date: 10 February 2011

Author's response to reviews:

10 February 2011
Dear Editor:

RE: MS 2038918614461278, “Molecular and Neurological Characterizations of three Saudi families with Lipoid Proteinosis”

We have assessed the new comments of your two reviewers and attempted to respond below to each comment. In each case, the reviewer’s comment is in bold, and our response is immediately below.

Reviewer 1

The authors responded satisfactory to my criticisms. However, the following minor corrections should be made to the final version:

1) Correct spelling of AMYGDALAE throughout the manuscript.
This change has been made throughout the manuscript except in the circumstances where “amygdala” was used because the singular version was appropriate.

2) Reference 4 doesn’t contain patient information and should therefore be removed on page 10.
Reference 4 has been removed from page 10.

This change has been made.
Reviewer 2

"These individuals illustrate the neurologic spectrum of LP, including variable mental retardation, personality changes, and mesial temporal calcification but imply that significant neurologic involvement may be somewhat less common than previously thought." This sentence is insufficient evidence; please indicate the reference.

We agree with the Reviewer that a lower-than-reported frequency of neurologic involvement would be difficult to prove with these three families. Therefore, this sentence has been altered to merely say, “These individuals illustrate the neurologic spectrum of LP, including variable mental retardation, personality changes, and mesial temporal calcification.” This, of course, is the main thrust of this aspect of the manuscript.

We again appreciate all the effort that the editorial staff and the reviewers have put into assessing our manuscript, and we again agree that this is now a stronger report with the suggested changes included. We understand the Journal’s policy of permitting only two revisions of a manuscript under consideration. However, we would like to point out that we adequately addressed all the previous concerns by the Reviewers and that this second review was prompted by new comments on their part that we obviously could not have anticipated.

Take care. We look forward to hearing from you.

Sincerely,

Mustafa A. Salih, MD
Khaled K. Abu-Amero, PhD
Thomas M. Bosley, MD