Reviewer's report

Title: A validation of the first genome-wide association study of calcaneus ultrasound parameters in the European Male Ageing Study

Version: 2 Date: 30 December 2010

Reviewer: david karasik

Reviewer's report:

The authors have provided appropriate responses to most of the concerns this reviewer raised.

However, I agree with the Rev. 1 that the large effect sizes reported in the earlier study of Framingham data (0.16 SD to 0.41 SD) are likely inflated due to 'winner’s curse' (thus 80% power indeed corresponds to SNPs with larger effects). This might be acknowledged as a limitation. Otherwise, it doesn’t detract from the general message.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests