Reviewer's report

Title: Analysis of positional candidate genes in the AAA1 susceptibility locus for abdominal aortic aneurysms on chromosome 19

Version: 2 Date: 30 November 2010

Reviewer: Janet Powell

Reviewer's report:

Revision has produced a much improved, better focused and clearer manuscript. The scientific work has been carried out robustly. However, the key limitations of the manuscript remain and remain largely undiscussed.

1 19q13 locus has been analysed based on preconceptions about mechanisms in AAA, rather than comprehensively exploring the entire locus (this is made very clear by the new figure 1.

2 The issue of multiple testing has been only addressed partially and the new table 2 makes it clear that only one SNP of borderline significance has been identified in the study. The manuscript now reads as though many of the same samples used in the 19q13 discovery set have been used again here. This might prejudice the significance of any p values reported.

The major reason for publishing this work is to prevent others from making the same mistakes and to urge a more comprehensive analysis of 19p13.

Major compulsory revisions
More in the discussion about the limitations of your approach and how you would have addressed the problem in 2010 and where to go next.

Minor revision
First line of the abstract, delete strong.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.