Reviewer's report

Title: TNFA -863 polymorphism is associated with a reduced risk of Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease: A replication study

Version: 2 Date: 25 July 2011

Reviewer: Masaaki Muramatsu

Reviewer's report:

The paper reports on the association of COPD and SNPs in the TNFa-LTA region. The authors found that -863 SNP of TNFa is associated with COPD related phenotypes. This result is in the same line by previous studies done in Asian and Caucasian populations, and thus this is a replication study.

Major comments:

There is no data presentation of the genotype and/or haplotype distributions of the smoker group, which might be more relevant for a control.

Statistical analysis of haplotype association is missing in the supplement.

The GLIM test for BODE index in Table 4 does not appear to give any positive difference in disease progression. Please explain this in detail.

Minor:

Page 6 line 8: What does concordance of >100% mean?
Page 8 line 4: did not varied # did not vary
Table 1: Why is the smoking history (pack-years) of 1+/−3?
Table 1: The value of FEV1 should be described in two significant digits.

There are many typographical and grammatical errors that should be corrected.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.