Reviewer's report

Title: Glutathione S-Transferase P1 (GSTP1) Gene Polymorphism Increases Age-Related Susceptibility of Hepatocellular Carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 3 August 2009

Reviewer: José M. M Ladero

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting and quite original report on the possible influence of GSTP1 and GSTA1 polymorphisms on the risk of developing hepatocellular carcinoma. However, some important questions arise after reading the article:

1. Results are negative. The finding of an excess of GSTP1 mutated genotypes among "younger" patients is a post-hoc result and it is not adequately supported: there are very few cases, the proportion of mutated genotypes is greater among "older" than among "younger" controls and the limit of 56 years is arbitrary. The main conclusion of this article is, at least, poorly substantiated.

2. The control group is not age-matched. A control group composed of patients with liver disease matched by age, sex, causal agent and tye stage of liver disease should be more adequate.


Results of this study are fully negative and the study group is larger than that included in this report.

I think that this study merits to be published, but it needs a revision in deep and it must be substantially shortened. Many data on tables are not relevant because are negative. These tables may be substituted by a short comment in the text indicating "data not shown".

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.
Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'