Reviewer's report

Title: WWOX gene is associated with HDL cholesterol and triglyceride levels

Version: 3 Date: 17 June 2010

Reviewer: M. Ilyas Kamboh

Reviewer's report:

The revised manuscript has been responsive to many, but not all questions raised in the prior review. Now it provides clarification that the WWOX genotype data was derived from a GWAS, indicating that the WWOX analysis is only one part of the GWAS. What are the other findings from this GWAS? Are they going to be published separately?

The authors state that they did not apply correction for multiple comparisons because it is “over-conservative.” However, they have identified some new and different significant signals not present in the original GWAS and some of which could be due to chance. Because of this, the prior review suggested to replicate these findings in an independent sample. Although the authors agree with the replication step, they say that it is not possible at this stage. In light of not correcting for multiple comparisons and not performing a replication step, some of the new associations may not be real.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.