Reviewer's report

Title: Hereditary Hemochromatosis (HFE) genotypes in heart failure: Relation to etiology and prognosis

Version: 1 Date: 15 February 2010

Reviewer: Yasuhiro Nagayoshi

Reviewer's report:

Møller et al. examined the frequency of the HFE genotypes in the patients with heart failure (HF). As a result of this study, HFE genotypes were not associated with systolic HF. Secondly, they concluded that HFE genotypes did not affect patient’s prognosis. Hereditary hemochromatosis is a common inherited disorder, especially in Northern Europe. Iron overload often leads to severe cardiomyopathy. However, not all patients with HFE mutations progress to significant iron overload. In this manuscript, there were no significant difference in the HFE genotype distribution between HF group and general population. This manuscript provides interesting and important insights. The authors should examine the following points.

Major Compulsory Revisions
1. HFE genotypes did not significantly affect all-cause mortality in HF. How about the cardiovascular death? The authors should add the table of causes of death.

2. In this study, patients with atrioventricular block or severe liver dysfunction were not included. The criteria of ‘severe’ liver cirrhosis should be added in the manuscript. As the authors mentioned, some patients with “classical” hereditary hemochromatosis were possibly excluded. If possible, the authors should show the frequency of the patients with hereditary hemochromatosis in the patients not included in this study criteria.

Discretionary Revisions
1. Plasma B-type natriuretic peptide (BNP) is an important and objective indicator in patients with HF. If possible, plasma BNP levels should be added in table 1.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.