Reviewer's report

Title: The mitochondrial DNA T16189C polymorphism and HIV-associated cardiomyopathy

Version: 1 Date: 9 February 2009

Reviewer: Jan Borgel

Reviewer's report:

1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined?  
   yes
2. Are the methods appropriate and well described?  
   yes
3. Are the data sound?  
   yes
4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition?  
   yes
5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data?  
   yes
6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated?  
   no - missing
7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished?  
   yes
8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found?  
   yes
9. Is the writing acceptable?  
   yes

Shaboodien et al. Investigated the mitochondrial DNA T16189C polymorphism, resulting in a homopolymeric C-tract, and HIV-associated cardiomyopathy in a collective of 30 HIV-positive cases with dilated cardiomyopathy and 37 HIV-positive controls. Cases and controls were matched for age, gender and stage of HIV-disease, patients with secondary causes of dilated cardiomyopathy were excluded.

They found no significant association of the above mentioned polymorphism
(Odds ratio 2.33, 95% Confidence Interval 0.67-8.06, p = 0.11).

- Discretionary Revisions
  none

- Minor Essential Revisions
  => A section “Limitations” is missing. The comparatively small sample size (compared to other association studies in cardiovascular medicine) should be mentioned – and the possibility that this result could be false negative.
  => In Table 2 – (homopolym… ... 8(30) => isn’t it 26%?)

- Major Compulsory Revisions
  None –

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'