Reviewer's report

Title: Association between CYP19 gene SNP rs2414096 Polymorphism and polycystic ovary syndrome in Chinese women

Version: 3 Date: 23 November 2009

Reviewer: DJ Marioli

Reviewer's report:

In the manuscript entitled “Association between CYP19 gene SNP rs2414096 polymorphism and polycystic ovary syndrome in Chinese women” by Jia-Li Jin et al., the authors address the question whether a single nucleotide polymorphism (rs2414096) located at exon 3 of the CYP19 gene is associated with PCOS and clinical characteristics of the syndrome. The authors conclude that rs2414096 SNP in CYP19 is associated with the pathogenesis of PCOS.

Still, the reviewer would like to advise the authors to closely edit the language of the manuscript as there are still few grammar mistakes. Furthermore, the reviewer would like to suggest that the authors should add a comment in the discussion section explaining the disadvantage of the study owning to the random collection of blood samples in women with amenorrhea. (see below the 2nd major compulsory revision of the previous review: 2. In materials and methods section the authors mention that blood samples were obtained at any time for subjects that had amenorrhea. In Table II standard deviation for LH are too high showing that blood samples were collected in different phases of the menstrual cycle in PCOS subjects (the authors have included in the study cohort PCOS women in pre-ovulatory phase and women in the ovulatory phase). However, blood samples should have been collected after a spontaneous bleeding episode in PCOS women with oligo-/a-menorrhea, a policy that is crucial for serum hormonal determinations and especially gonadotropins and estradiol. Thus, any association with hormonal values could be attributed to differences in the menstrual cycle.)