Reviewer's report

Title: Do the mutations of C1GALT1C1 gene play important roles in the genetic susceptibility to Chinese IgA nephropathy?

Version: 1 Date: 15 December 2008

Reviewer: Frank Eitner

Reviewer's report:

Li et al study mutations/SNP’s in the cosmc/C1GALT1C1 gene in IgAN patients. The authors report a SNP in the promoter region, but no significant difference between cases and controls. Furthermore, this SNP was not associated with renal survival in IgAN patients. Finally, sequencing of the whole coding region of C1GALT1C1 in 202 clones from peripheral B lymphocytes failed to detect new mutations except the known rs17261572 SNP in 3 individuals.

Criticism:
The authors report a minor allele frequency of 48.48% of the rs3810744 SNP. Does this number relate to IgAN cases or controls?
There are some inconsistencies between the number of cases in table 1 and table 2. The total number of male cases should be 380 (table 1), but is 381 in table 2 (210 +171). The total number of female cases should be 281(table 1), but is 279 in table 2 (104+114+61). The second last row in table 2 indicates that 322 female cases had a G. This would be more than the total of 281 female cases.
The authors should specify whether the rs17261572 SNP’s were identified in B lymphocytes from IgAN cases or controls.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.