Reviewer's report

Title: Semi-automated segmentation and quantification of adipose tissue in calf and thigh by MRI: a preliminary study in patients with monogenic metabolic syndrome

Version: 2 Date: 9 August 2006

Reviewer: Jürgen Machann

Reviewer's report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Page 12, line 8ff: … inclusion of only adipose tissue connected to the initial subcutaneous seed point: this seems not to be correct! As can be seen in Figure 3, there is also adipose tissue included which is lying between the muscles without any connection to subcutaneous adipose tissue!

Figure 3: the upper, original spin echo image and the sc+inf† image are still from different slice positions! Please include identical slice position for both!

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Page 5, line 16: again: please don’t write “matched†, when it isn’t matched at all! Replace by comparable
Page 6, last line: “MRI scanned images† replace by “MR images†
Page 7, line 22: signal intensity instead of image intensity

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests