Reviewer's report

Title: A semiautomatic tool for prostate segmentation in radiotherapy treatment planning

Version: 11 Date: 31 December 2013

Reviewer: S. Sara Mahdavi

Reviewer's report:

My concern regarding novelty of the method still exists. Ellipse fitting may be very fast but the shape of the prostate is not elliptical and modification of the boundary will definitely be required in most images resulting in similar amount of work compared to manual contouring.

Moreover, the results are not significantly better than more sophisticated models presented in other works.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.