Reviewer’s report

Title: Herlyn-werner-wunderlich syndrome: MRI findings, radiological guide (two cases and literature review), and differential diagnosis

Version: 2 Date: 5 September 2011

Reviewer: Nirmala Duhan

Reviewer’s report:

Herlyn Werner Wunderlich syndrome- MRI findings, radiological guide

The manuscript describes 2 cases of HWW syndrome diagnosed by MRI and one case of unicornuate uterus.
It has numerous spelling and grammar errors.
The script (all sections) is scattered with lack of continuity and coherence

Introduction:
Scattered introduction
Incidences should not follow etiopathogenesis...
References missing in incidences paragraph
‘HWW occurs after menarche’ is untrue. It presents at menarche.
Include problems in diagnosis
Introduction needs to be rewritten

Patient I:
Pain and pelvic masses should be described
Dead-end vagina…..appears to be considerably RELAXES…. Inappropriate choice of words

Patient II:
Physical examination needs specific elaboration
Right vagina was atresic…. Is incorrect.

Patient III:
Is not a case of HWW syndrome, so may be excluded from the script.

Discussion:
Ultrasound is a good tool for this diagnosis and most cases can be picked up on it. Correct the statement ‘but is insufficient’
MRI only for selected cases.
‘An absolute diagnostic certainty is obtained on laparoscopy’ This terminal
statement is incorrect and should be withdrawn.
Treatment cannot be generalized for all MDAs and not all will be treatable by laparoscopy. So it is not the 'most appropriate treatment'.
Mention OHVIRA syndrome