Reviewer's report

Title: Vibration Response Imaging: evaluation of rater agreement in healthy subjects and subjects with pneumonia

Version: 6 Date: 14 October 2009

Reviewer: Mordechai Yigla

Reviewer's report:

Reviewer's report

-------------

- Minor Essential Revisions

1. Figure 4 – Is the legend correct for the histograms? In the legend, the healthy population is indicated by light gray; therefore, a higher percentage of healthy subjects have dysnchronization, artefacts and abnormalities corresponding with consolidation on chest x-ray. Also, are there significant differences between the healthy and pneumonia population for these VRI features? If so, then this should be indicated on the graphs.

2. Also, Figure 4 appears as Figure 4 in the text, but as Figure 3 in the Figure Legends (page 23). Figure labeling in text should be checked with Figure Legends.

3. Page 9 and page 10 of new article - what does reference [45] refer to...numbering is up to 22 in the reference list?

4. Page 11: inter-rater agreement % range should be (88%-100%).

5. The number of images that each of the reviewers assessed is not stated clearly in the text. I assume that the number is 86 images (43*2), but this should be stated.

6. Table 1 has a typo and should be written as "participants".

What next?

-------------

- Accept after minor essential revisions (which the authors can be trusted to make)

Quality of written English

--------------------------

- Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review

------------------
- No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.