Reviewer’s report

Title: Extraperitoneal Urine Leak after Renal Transplantation: The Role of Radionuclide Imaging and the Value of Accompanying SPECT/CT - A Case Report Hongju Son, MD, Sherif Heiba, MD, Lale Kostakoglu, MD, and Josef Machac, MD The Division of Nuclear Medicine, Department of Radiology, The Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York, NY Corresponding authors: Josef Machac, MD. The Mount Sinai School of Medicine, Division of Nuclear Medicine, One Gustave L. Levy Place, Box 1141, New York, NY 10029-6574. Tel: 212-241-7888, Fax: 212-831-2851, E-mail: Josef.Machac@mssm.edu

Version: 1 Date: 9 May 2010

Reviewer: Mohamed Abou El-Ghar

Reviewer’s report:

Major compulsory:

1- In the introduction the authors must mention the algorithm of diagnosis of urinary leakage post kidney transplantation as this is not the usual to start with isotope renography or SPECT-CT.

2- In the material and methods the authors not explained why they started with isotope study after US in this case with urine leakage from the skin.

3- Why ascending cystography not done to exclude leakage from urinary bladder.

4- I think that trial of percutaneous nephrostomy with or without JJ fixation can be tried first and antegrade pyelography will reveal the site of leakage.

5- What is the impact of the identification of the extension of urinoma on patient’s management.

6- Non- contrast CT alone is enough to detect the extension of leakage.

7- Why authors not used MRI to diagnose urinoma to avoid exposure to radiation.

8- I think that the statement in discussion that renography commonly used in diagnosis of urine leak is old.

Minor essentials:

1- In the first line of abstract “the postoperative” to be changed to the early postoperative.

2- Some of references are old.

3- Reformatted CT images of low quality.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'